



# ‘Not simply pastor-teacher, but also apostle, prophet and evangelist’: The changing role of the Church of Scotland Parish Minister

*Neil Dougall*

---

In a Christendom context, the ministry of Word and Sacrament has come to be equated with the pastor-teacher of Ephesians 4:11. In the Christendom model, where the settled community gathers into the settled church, the settled ministry of Word and Sacrament as a pastor-teacher can nurture people to faith in Christ and into Christian maturity.

The challenge of our more fluid culture invites us to revisit Ephesians 4:11 and reinstate the lost callings of the evangelist, the prophet and the apostle [...]. Of the five leadership roles, three [i.e. apostle, prophet, evangelist] are pointing outwards, and two [i.e. pastor, teacher<sup>1</sup>] pointing inwards.<sup>2</sup>

This paper will explore, first, why the dominant model of the ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Church of Scotland has been that of pastor-teacher and explain why that now needs to change; and, second, consider whether the Church of Scotland’s understanding of ordination is compatible with such a change. I will show that (drawing on the work of T. F. Torrance) by taking a Christological view of ordination, one which is rooted in the vicarious humanity of Christ, there is a sound basis for also ordaining ministers to roles which are more aligned to those of apostle, prophet and evangelist than that of pastor-teacher.



## The minister as pastor-teacher

John Calvin, referring to the five roles found in Ephesians 4:11 said that only pastors and teachers ‘have an ordinary office in the church’, explaining that ‘the Lord raised up [apostles, prophets and evangelists] at the beginning of his Kingdom, and now and again revives them as the need of the times demands.’<sup>73</sup> In 1645, in *The Form of Presbyterian Church Government* the Westminster Assembly went further, describing apostles, evangelists and prophets as ‘extraordinary’ officers, ‘which are ceased.’<sup>74</sup> In the chapter on Ministry in *A Manual of Church Doctrine According to the Church of Scotland* (first published in 1920, revised and enlarged in 1960) this statement is repeated:

The Standards of the Church of Scotland find in the New Testament mention of two types of Ministry, and distinguish them as ordinary and extraordinary. Among the *extraordinary* are reckoned Apostles, Evangelists and Prophets; and these are said to have ceased.<sup>5</sup>

At that time this statement needed no further explanation or justification. Therefore nothing further is said about the apostle, evangelist and prophet; the role of a Church of Scotland minister is to be a pastor and teacher, which, again drawing on *The Form of Presbyterian Church Government*, is expressed in this way:

It belongs to the office of the minister to pray for and with his flock, as the mouth of the people unto God; to pray for the sick; to read the Scriptures publicly, to feed the flock by preaching the Word; to catechize; to dispense other divine mysteries; to administer the Sacraments; to bless the people from God; to take care of the poor; and to rule over the flock as a pastor.<sup>6</sup>

This understanding of the role of the ordained minister is not limited to the Reformed tradition. The same essential identity of the minister as pastor and teacher is echoed in *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, the seminal publication of the World Council of Churches:

The chief responsibility of the ordained ministry is to assemble and build up the body of Christ by proclaiming and teaching that Word of God, by celebrating the sacraments, and by guiding the life of the community in its worship, its mission and its caring ministry.<sup>7</sup>

As part of a process of responding to *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, the Church of Scotland's Panel on Doctrine reported in 1989, 'The tasks of the ministry are assumed to be preaching, administering the sacraments and nurturing the flock through teaching and pastoral care.'<sup>8</sup>

The equating of ministry with the role of pastor-teacher is both understandable and appropriate within a Christendom context. In Christendom, Christianity is the official religion. Church and state give each other mutual support and legitimacy. By virtue of birth every person is part not simply of the nation, but also of the church:

Once the Christian religion had become the only allowed religion within the boundaries of Christendom, mission was not seen as the central task of the church. Rather, her theological definition came to focus upon the care and tending of the salvation of her members, who were simultaneously citizens of Christendom.<sup>9</sup>

The Reformation led to a significant change in the understanding of the role of ministers. Guder characterizes this as a shift from 'Priests to Pedagogues'.<sup>10</sup> The Reformation, however, did not lead to the demise of Christendom, but to its splintering. As a result, Calvin and his successors identified the minister with the role of pastor-teacher in Ephesians 4:11.

This identification is now being increasingly questioned within the Church of Scotland<sup>11</sup> for Scotland is clearly living through the ending of Christendom. Stuart Murray calls this 'Post-Christendom', which he defines as 'the culture that emerges as the Christian faith loses coherence within a society that has been definitively shaped by the Christian story and as the institutions that have been developed to express Christian convictions decline in influence.'<sup>12</sup> At the beginning

of this millennium, although church membership and church attendance were falling, the fact that two-thirds of Scottish people still identified themselves as Christian offered a degree of comfort. The 2011 census revealed both the extent and the speed of the ebbing of Christendom.<sup>13</sup>

| Year                   | 2001 | 2011 |
|------------------------|------|------|
| All Christian (%)      | 65   | 54   |
| Church of Scotland (%) | 42   | 32   |
| No religion (%)        | 28   | 37   |

The Church of Scotland, which as its name suggests, has understood itself to be the spiritual representative of the nation, is now outnumbered by those who claim to have no religion.

In 2000 *Ministers of the Gospel*, a major report on ministry, was presented to the General Assembly. In the main this continues to suggest that the ministry of Word and Sacrament should be identified with the role of pastor-teacher. It says, the Church of Scotland ‘believes that Christ has gifted to his Church an authorised form of ministry to pass on the Apostolic teaching, as preachers and teachers of the Gospel. In the Church of Scotland, that order of ministry has been known as the ordained ministry of the Gospel in Word and Sacrament.’<sup>14</sup> Later the report asserts, ‘Their primary focus should be on the ministry of Word and Sacrament, and because of this, they need to be well equipped to lead worship.’<sup>15</sup> At the same time, the report is very aware of the changing context the church finds itself in. It describes Scotland as a ‘highly “secular” society, in terms of the percentage of the adult population who go to church.’<sup>16</sup> This leads to a recognition that the role of ministers will also need to change:

The sheer scale and relentless pace of social change has persuaded the Board that the Church will need ministers who

can help it to act in ways that are faithful to the unchanging Gospel and appropriate to a changing Scotland. In a more secular culture which questions traditional religious beliefs and institutions and in a more mobile society with fragmented and diverse patterns of living, the Church requires ministers who can help it discern the fresh relevance of the Gospel, build and sustain inclusive communities of faith and equip its members for mission and service in a complex world.<sup>17</sup>

In the 2011 report of the Ministries Council, the phrase ‘*20:20 Vision: Refocusing the Ministries of the Church on Mission*’<sup>18</sup> first appeared. It became a strapline that featured prominently in the work of the Council between 2012 and 2015<sup>19</sup> and indicates that a shift in the understanding of ministry was taking place. In the previous decade there had been an increasing recognition within the Church of Scotland of the importance of mission. Significant milestones included *Church Without Walls* (2001),<sup>20</sup> the creation of the Parish Development Fund (2002),<sup>21</sup> the affirmation of ‘a “mixed economy church” [...] where both existing expressions and fresh expressions of church co-exist’ (2008),<sup>22</sup> and the setting up of the Emerging Ministries Fund (2009).<sup>23</sup> This in turn fuelled discussion about the nature and role of the minister of Word and Sacrament.

In the 2012 report of the Ministries Council there is a shift in language. In responding to an instruction from the previous year, which talked of the ‘Full-Time Ministry of Word and Sacrament as the pivotal expression of Ministry’,<sup>24</sup> the Council chose to speak of ‘Parish Ministry’. This partly reflected the introduction of Ordained Local Ministry (a non-stipendiary ministry of Word and Sacrament) and the increasing number of part-time parish ministry positions. At a deeper level, it may also have reflected a sense that the very nature of parish ministry was changing. The report described the changing context the church found itself in: both the ending of Christendom and the suggestion, from Professor Phil Hanlon, that Western society is not simply living through an age of change, but also through a *change of age*.<sup>25</sup> As the Council tried to understand this and its implications for ministers, perhaps it had the sense that the descriptor, *minister of Word and Sacrament*, tended to identify the role too much with that of

pastor-teacher and that this did not adequately capture the breadth of the role that many Church of Scotland ministers fulfill. Particularly it tended to minimise the missional dimension.<sup>26</sup>

In May 2015 the Ministries Council produced a recruitment video, *Tomorrow's Calling*.<sup>27</sup> It was composed of short clips of Church of Scotland ministers in action. None of them featured Sunday worship or a church sanctuary. None were sacramental, though two were ministry of the Word – a school assembly and a service in an old people's home. It portrayed ministry as engagement with people either on the fringes of or outwith the church.

All this is evidence both of the profound changes that have taken place in Scotland in the last generation and of the Church of Scotland listening both to culture and the Holy Spirit. What has been lacking so far, I suggest, is a theological rationale for a different understanding of ministry and in particular an explanation of how this might fit with the Church of Scotland's understanding of ordination. In the next section I will begin to sketch out what this might look like.



### **Ministry is more than being a pastor-teacher**

So Christ himself gave the apostles, the prophets, the evangelists, the pastors and teachers, to equip his people for works of service, so that the whole body of Christ may be built up

Ephesians 4:11,12 (NIV)

Almost forty years ago, Michael Harper wrote, 'The spotlight in our day is more and more being put on Ephesians 4 as a definitive chapter on ministry in the Bible.'<sup>28</sup> While he may have been ahead of the curve it is now the starting point for many discussions. For example, Frost and Hirsch write:

We think it is to the detriment of the mission of the church that the role of the evangelist has been marginalized and made itinerant rather than localized. And we see it as even more concerning that the functions of prophet and apostle have been

ignored by mainstream churches altogether. But we reiterate our belief that only when all five are operating in unity or harmony can we see effective missional engagement begin to occur.<sup>29</sup>

The term *apostle* can be confusing. It tends to be used in two different ways.

In the New Testament [it] is used for the Twelve but also for a wider circle of disciples. It is applied to Paul and others as they are sent out by the risen Christ to proclaim the Gospel. The roles of the apostles, cover both foundation and mission. [...] The role of the apostles as witnesses to the resurrection of Christ is unique and unrepeatable. There is therefore a difference between the apostles and the ordained ministers whose ministries are founded on theirs.<sup>30</sup>

When contemporary writers suggest that the role of apostle be recovered they are using the word in a different sense. As the New Testament apostles had a role in empowering and developing other leaders, the apostolic role today involves developing new initiatives and the oversight of other leaders.<sup>31</sup>

Frost and Hirsch explain the five role of Ephesians 4:11 as follows:

- *Apostolic function*, usually conducted translocally, pioneers new missional works and oversees their development.
- *Prophetic function* discerns the spiritual realities in a given situation and communicates them in a timely and appropriate way to further the mission of God's people.
- *Evangelistic function* communicates the gospel in such a way that people respond in faith and discipleship.
- *Pastoral function* shepherds the people of God by leading, nurturing, protecting, and caring for them.
- *Teaching function* communicates the revealed wisdom of God so that the people of God learn how to obey all that Christ has commanded them.<sup>32</sup>

They, and others, are at pains to stress that no single person has the gifts to play all these roles: ‘Leadership that demonstrates this apostolic nature of the kingdom will take place through a plurality of leaders.’<sup>33</sup> The focus of this leadership is outward looking. Whereas in Christendom the focus of ministry was the life of the church – teaching God’s people and their pastoral care, which made sense since everyone was automatically part of the church – in post-Christendom the focus of ministry is outward. It is through the recovery of the roles of apostle, prophet and evangelist that the church will be able to do this.

The purpose of leadership is to form and equip a people who demonstrate and announce the purpose and direction of God through Jesus Christ. Such leadership, through the agency of the Holy Spirit, works to create people whose life is a witness to Jesus Christ.<sup>34</sup>

How might an understanding of ministry that encompasses these five roles fit with the understanding of ministry within the Church of Scotland? In particular, how might it fit with the Church of Scotland’s understanding of ordination to the ministry of Word and Sacrament, which is primarily that of pastor-teacher?

In 2011 Ordained Local Ministry (a non-stipendiary ministry of Word and Sacrament that replaced Auxiliary Ministry) came into being. The difference between this ministry and that of the Readership had been spelt out in 2010. Readers (who are not ordained) are ‘Locally deployed with remit in worship and preaching; can be “Attached” with a wider remit, including pastoral care.’ Ordained Local Ministers are ‘Locally deployed with remit in worship, preaching *and sacramental ministry*; can also have a pastoral care element.’<sup>35</sup> Since a sacramental ministry is the one element that both full-time ordained ministers and Ordained Local Ministers have but non-ordained Readers do not, it is apparent why many people understand that the purpose of ministerial ordination within the Church of Scotland is to be able to celebrate the sacraments. Further, since celebrating the sacraments belongs primarily to the role of pastor-teacher rather than that of the apostle,



prophet or evangelist it is also understandable that some fear that broadening the role of the Church of Scotland ministry is incompatible with our understanding of the ordained ministry.

While this may be the popular understanding of ordination I think it is flawed for two reasons, the first theological, the second in terms of our practice.



## Theological

This popular view of ordination is based on the holiness of God. It is explored in detail by Thomas Dozeman in *Holiness and Ministry*.<sup>36</sup> He says,

Ordination for ministry derives from the holiness of God. If God were not holy, there would be no such thing as religion in human experience, nor would there be any need for a select group of ordained persons to work in the service of the sacred.<sup>37</sup>

The holiness of God means that God is other than we are. There is a separation between the realm of the sacred where God is found, and the realm of the profane where humans dwell. The sacred and the profane meet in sanctuaries. Certain individuals are consecrated to minister in that sanctuary, mediating between the holiness of God and the sinfulness of humans.

In developing a theology of ordination, Dozeman draws on the experience and ministry of Moses, which he says ‘provides the biblical foundation for the ordination to word and sacrament in Christian tradition.’<sup>38</sup>

While I am not persuaded by the typology of Moses that Dozeman offers,<sup>39</sup> the main problem with his position is that it does not deal adequately with the death of Christ. The priesthood of all believers was one of the fundamental ideas of the Reformation. Calvin for example wrote:

Christ was appointed and consecrated priest according to the order of Melchizedek by the Father with an oath [...]. He once



for all offered a sacrifice of eternal expiation and reconciliation; now, having also entered the sanctuary of heaven, he intercedes for us. In him we are all priests [...]<sup>40</sup>

Since Jesus has already bridged the gap between the sacred and the profane, humans do not need (to use Dozeman's words) 'an ordained one' to do this for them. Since Jesus is our High Priest we do not need a human being to act in a priestly manner when we celebrate the Holy Communion.



## Practice

Ordination in the Church of Scotland does not derive from the holiness of God. It has never been understood in a priestly fashion. People are not ordained to be mediators, nor are they consecrated so they can safely handle the holy elements of bread and wine. Instead ordination is based on two other principles, the need for order, and the call of God.<sup>41</sup>

Ordination is derived from the Latin *ordinare*, to order. The church requires a degree of organisation and ordering. If it is to function as God intended, if it is to be faithful in its mission, it needs to appoint individuals to particular roles so that worship is meaningful, people are cared for, the good news is proclaimed and God's love is displayed. So put simply, 'Ordination is a solemn setting apart of a person for some public Church office.'<sup>42</sup>

This is why the Church of Scotland ordains people not simply to the ministry of Word and Sacrament but also to the eldership and (since 2001) to the diaconate (a non-sacramental ministry primarily of service). It understands both eldership and the diaconate to be diaconal ministries that are concerned with enabling the church to respond in witness and service to the grace of God received through Word and Sacrament. This is distinct from, but no less important than, the ministry of Word and Sacrament.<sup>43</sup>

In the understanding of the Church of Scotland, 'ordination is not for the creation of a clerical caste, but is about the practical exercise of ministries.'<sup>44</sup> Ordination should be to a ministry that meets the following four criteria. Ministry should:

- i. be concerned not just with one part of the church's life, but with keeping the church true to its nature and calling;
- ii. be understood to be a part of the ministries of the universal church;
- iii. be a vocation tested and affirmed by the church;
- iv. endure through time.<sup>45</sup>

This lens helps not only explains why the Church of Scotland ordains not simply ministers, but also elders and deacons; it also offers a different understanding of the purpose of ministerial ordination. If it is not primarily so that they can exercise a sacramental ministry, there is no obvious reason why that ordination might not be extended to those whose ministry is primarily that of apostle, prophet or evangelist, and who might not have a sacramental dimension to their ministry.

Understanding ordination to be solely about ordering the life of the church leads to a functional view of ordination,<sup>46</sup> which does not properly reflect the Church of Scotland's position. In its understanding, ordination is also a means of affirming the call of God on an individual's life. In the words of the Panel on Doctrine, 'It is essentially the Church's acknowledgement of a divine call to ministry.'<sup>47</sup> Through ordination, the church affirms that an individual's sense of call to a particular ministry has been tested and that appropriate preparation has been completed. 'Ordination indicates the call of a person to a ministry, and the person's acceptance of and appointment to that ministry.'<sup>48</sup> The act of ordination is both a recognition of God's call and a prayer for the Holy Spirit to equip and empower the individual for that ministry. This gives ordination a dual character, 'ordination by the Risen Lord and by the Church in history'.<sup>49</sup>



## **T. F. Torrance**

The work of T. F. Torrance provides a Christological framework, which offers a dimension of depth<sup>50</sup> for the Church of Scotland's understanding of ordination.

When we turn to the consecration and ordination of a special ministry as Christ's gift to His Church we find that this has its place only within the consecration of the whole membership of Christ's Body, and therefore within the ministry of the whole Body, which it has through sharing in Christ's vicarious self-consecration.<sup>51</sup>

The vicarious humanity of Christ is a key concept in Torrance's thinking. 'Vicarious humanity means that everything Christ has done and suffered in his humanity was done and suffered in our place and for our benefit.'<sup>52</sup> Jesus Christ fully took on our humanity. Through our baptism we participate and share in Christ's obedience. Our baptism,

is not a separate or a new baptism but a participation in the one all-inclusive baptism common to Christ and his Church, wrought out vicariously in Christ alone [...]. That is why baptism is understood only in that dimension of depth reaching back into Jesus Christ himself, for it belongs to the peculiar nature of baptism that in it we partake of a redemption that has already been accomplished for us in Christ.<sup>53</sup>

A similar pattern is found in the Lord's Supper:

Thus the eucharistic sacrifice means that we *through the Spirit* are so intimately united to Christ, by communion with his body and blood, that we participate in his self-consecration and self-offering to the Father and thus appear with him and in him and through him before the Majesty of God in worship, praise and adoration with no other sacrifice than the sacrifice of Christ Jesus our Mediator and High Priest.<sup>54</sup>

Christ's vicarious humanity also offers us a way of understanding ordination and ministry.

There is one ministry, that of Jesus Christ. The writer of Hebrews articulates at length and in depth the priesthood of Jesus. It is all sufficient, effective and eternal:

Therefore since we have a great high priest who has ascended into heaven, Jesus the Son of God, let us hold firmly to the faith we profess. [...] Let us then approach God's throne of grace with confidence, so that we may receive mercy and find grace to help us in our time of need. (4:14,16)

He has become a high priest forever, in the order of Melchizedek. (6:20)

because Jesus lives forever, he has a permanent priesthood. Therefore he is able to save completely those who come to God through him, because he always lives to intercede for them. (7:24, 25)

Christ is the mediator of a new covenant, that those who are called may receive the promised eternal inheritance (9:15a)

The conviction that Christ is our High Priest, through whom all have direct access to God, gave rise to the Reformation understanding of the priesthood of all believers. No one needs a human priest to intercede on their behalf with God; they themselves can approach God directly. Therefore the ordination of some to be ministers is not to be understood as the creation of a super-spiritual order. All Christians share in Christ's self-consecration and any ordination to ministry is grounded in the once-and-for-all consecration of the whole Church in Christ:

Those ordained are to be regarded as drawn in a special way within the sphere of Christ's self-consecration so that it is only as they share in His self-consecration that they can minister the Word to others in His Name.<sup>55</sup>

Although it is human beings who perform the act of ordination, this is but the outward sign of an inward reality:

It is the Risen and Ascended Lord who acts directly through His Spirit ordaining His servant to the ministry, but He does

that in and through the Church which He has once and for all established [...]<sup>56</sup>

Torrance offers a helpful lens through which to understand the nature of ministry and the purpose of ordination: while ministry is something humans do, at a deeper level it is a sharing in the ministry of Christ. Ordination, has both an outward dimension (it is an act through which people are set apart and authorized to play a particular role) and an inward dimension (Christ ordains, filling an individual with his Spirit so they are equipped for the role he is calling them to).

When we link this understanding of ministry and ordination with Ephesians 4:11 we can draw three initial conclusions.

First, there is no warrant for limiting ministry to that of the pastor-teacher, nor for equating ordained ministry with the ministry of Word and Sacrament.

Second, the ministry of Jesus Christ, in which all ministers share, encompassed all the five roles mentioned in Ephesians 4:11.

- Jesus Christ is the great apostle. Hebrews names him as such (3:1), but more importantly he is the one who expresses apostleship. The root meaning of ‘apostle’ is one who is sent. Christ is both the one who was sent by God and who sends us. ‘As the Father has sent me, I am sending you.’ (John 20:21). Therefore all apostle-type ministry in the church, that of pioneering new developments and overseeing other leaders, is both modeled on Christ and shares in his apostolic role.
- Jesus Christ is the great prophet. During his ministry Jesus was described as a prophet, but more importantly he is the one who captures what it means to be a prophet. A prophet speaks a word from God that resonates with a particular context. A prophet both listens to God and reads a situation – then speaks God’s word for that situation. No one has ever done that better than Jesus. Therefore all prophetic-type ministry in the church, that is communicating the right word from God for a given context, is both modeled on Christ and shares in his prophetic role.

- Jesus Christ is the great evangelist. Mark introduces Jesus' ministry by saying, 'Jesus went into Galilee, proclaiming the good news of God' (Mark 1:14) – the Greek is *euangelion* from which we derive the word evangelist. One of the hallmarks of Jesus' ministry was his preaching. Both its content and its accessibility made a huge impression, leading thousands to believe. Therefore all evangelist-type ministry in the church, that is sharing the good news in such a way that people outside the church believe, is both modeled on Christ and shares in his evangelist role.
- Jesus Christ is the great pastor. He is described as the 'Chief Shepherd' (1 Peter 5:4) and more importantly, in his care for people, demonstrates the nature of the pastoral call. The gospels frequently speak of Christ being moved by compassion, which prompted him to act. Therefore all pastoral-type ministry in the church, that is caring for people in the name of Jesus, is both modeled on Christ and shares in his pastoral role.
- Jesus Christ is the great teacher. The Sermon on the Mount is introduced with the phrase, 'he [Jesus] began to teach them' (Matthew 5:2). Matthew's gospel records five significant blocks of teaching, reflecting a significant feature of his ministry. Disciples, friends, enquirers and enemies addressed him as teacher, probably reflecting his designation as a Rabbi. Therefore all teaching-type ministry in the church, that is explaining what it means to live the Jesus-way, is both modeled on Christ and shares in his teaching role.

Third, it is both logical and legitimate to extend ordination to those whose ministry might fall more into the role of apostle, prophet and evangelist than that of pastor and teacher.



## Conclusion

Christendom in Scotland is rapidly disappearing. As the context that the Church of Scotland finds itself in has changed and continues to change, the nature and focus of the ministry that it needs is changing. While the ministry of pastor-teachers was, by and large, all the church



once required, that is no longer the case. It will still need some who devote themselves to the inner life of the church, both through caring for its members and teaching them, so there is still a role for pastors and teachers. The preaching of the Word and the celebration of the sacraments will also continue to be vital for the life and well-being of the church. The church will be in grave danger if, however, it restricts ministry to this role.

The main focus of the church, however, needs to be outward. The recovery of the missional dimension is more than a necessary survival strategy, 'it must be seen as the fundamental, the essential, the centering understanding of the church's purpose and action.'<sup>57</sup> The roles of the apostle, prophet and evangelist are gifts that can help the church with this. So it is essential that its understanding of ministry is broadened to include them. Three final points should be made.

First, the New Testament insight that the church is a body<sup>58</sup> is essential. No one individual can be expected to, or should try, to play all five roles. There is a breadth to the ministry that the church requires, which will require the collaboration and cooperation of a number of people working in a team. Effective ministry within a Church of Scotland parish will require all these roles in some way to be covered.

Second, given the Church of Scotland's understanding of ordination there is no reason why ordination should be limited to the person who is authorized to celebrate the sacraments. A case could be made, using the four criteria mentioned earlier, for ordaining an individual serving in any of the five roles. All might be ordained, some might be ordained, or one might be ordained to this ministry. The practical implications of this are complicated and will require significant discussion. Once, however, the principle has been accepted there is no reason why such discussion should not take place.

Third, my hunch is, that of the five roles, the one that the Church of Scotland is in most need of at present is that of the apostle. In parishes across the country there is a growing recognition that the church needs to recover its missional dimension, but people do not know how to do this. There are gifted and willing people in congregations who want to serve their community and bear witness to Jesus Christ but are not sure where to begin. They are looking for leadership. They are hoping that their parish minister will offer leadership – a leadership



that both enables them to engage with their community in a new way, and empowers them to play their part in the body of Christ. This leadership role fits most closely with that of the apostle. So, while not imposing limits on parish ministry, I think that the major focus at this time should be on the role of the apostle.<sup>59</sup>

## Notes

- <sup>1</sup> For a discussion on whether pastor-teacher is one or two roles see for example Frank Thielman, *Ephesians* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker, 2010), 276, and Peter T. O'Brien, *The Letter to the Ephesians* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1999), 300. Whether the combination of pastor-teacher is as envisaged by Ephesians, or a combination of two roles is not material to this paper.
- <sup>2</sup> Peter Neilson, *Church on the Move: New Church, New Generation, New Scotland* (Glasgow: Covenanters Press, 2005), 132.
- <sup>3</sup> John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1960), IV.3.4.
- <sup>4</sup> Westminster Assembly, *The Confession of Faith; The Larger Catechism; The Shorter Catechism; The Directory For Publick Worship; The Form of Presbyterian Church Government* (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1959), 172.
- <sup>5</sup> H. J. Wotherspoon and J. M. Kirkpatrick, *A Manual of Church Doctrine According to the Church of Scotland* (2nd ed., revised and enlarged by T. F. Torrance and R. Selby Wright; London, OUP, 1960), 79.
- <sup>6</sup> Ibid., 73.
- <sup>7</sup> World Council of Churches, *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry* (25th anniversary printing; Geneva: WCC, 2007): Ministry, 13.
- <sup>8</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland 1989* (Edinburgh: Church of Scotland, 1989), 194. (Reports are hereafter cited as *Reports to the General Assembly [year]*.)
- <sup>9</sup> Darrell L. Guder, "The Church as Missional Community", in *The Community of the Word: Toward an Evangelical Ecclesiology*, ed.

- Mark Husbands and Daniel J. Treier; (Downers Grove, Ill.: IVP, 2005), 118.
- <sup>10</sup> Darrell L. Guder, ed., *Missional Church: A Vision for the Sending of the Church in North America* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1998), 192.
- <sup>11</sup> This critique appears to begin with *A Church Without Walls*. ‘The term “ministry of word and sacrament” remains our description of “the ordained minister”. [...] It represents an unquestioned assumption that sticks with the role of pastor-teacher as the primary model of leadership. [...] This is a time to recover and reaffirm these other roles of leadership and break out of the reductionism of the pastor-teacher model.’ *Reports to the General Assembly 2001*, 36/29.
- <sup>12</sup> Stuart Murray, *Post-Christendom* (Carlisle: Paternoster, 2004), 19.
- <sup>13</sup> Scotland’s Census: Census 2011 <http://www.scotlandscensus.gov.uk/news/census-2011-release-2a>, accessed 23/6/15.
- <sup>14</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2000*, 17/8.
- <sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, 17/11.
- <sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*, 17/13.
- <sup>18</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2011*, 4/2.
- <sup>19</sup> I was a member of the Ministries Council: 2005–09, one of its Vice-Conveners: 2009–12 and its Convener: 2012–15.
- <sup>20</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2001*, 36/1.
- <sup>21</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2002*, 8/1.
- <sup>22</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2008*, 3/1.
- <sup>23</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2009*, 3/48.
- <sup>24</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2012*, 4/11.
- <sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>26</sup> ‘The term “missional” is an attempt to move the discussion beyond too-narrow definitions of mission as merely one among the various programs of the church, and to find ways to think about the church’s calling and practice today.’ Guder, “The Church as Missional Community”, 116.
- <sup>27</sup> Church of Scotland, “Tomorrow’s Calling”, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CL1qCz7p9eo>, accessed 24/6/15.

- 28 Michael Harper, *Let My People Grow: Ministry and Leadership in the Church* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1977), 37.
- 29 Michael Frost and Alan Hirsch, *The Shaping of Things to Come: Innovation and Mission for the 21<sup>st</sup>-Century Church* (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 2003), 169.
- 30 WCC, *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*: Ministry, commentary 9; section 10.
- 31 Richard C. West and Dan Noel, “Situational Discipleship: The Five-fold Ministry Roles of Ephesians 4:11 and Their Relationship to the Situational Leadership Model”, *Culture & Religion Review Journal* 2013/3: 96–116 (107, 111).
- 32 Frost and Hirsch, *The Shaping of Things to Come*, 169.
- 33 Guder, *Missional Church*, 186.
- 34 Ibid., 183.
- 35 *Reports to the General Assembly 2010*, 3/29.
- 36 His purpose in writing is to offer a biblical theology of ordination which he believes is lacking in the church today. 5.
- 37 Thomas B. Dozeman, *Holiness and Ministry: A Biblical Theology of Ordination* (New York: OUP, 2008), 12.
- 38 Ibid., 6.
- 39 ‘[His] extensive application of the Mosaic model to the NT understandings of ordination, however, is not always convincing. His focus on continuity underplays the discontinuities; the parallels he draws between the high priest, priest, and Levite of the Pentateuch and the bishop, priest, and deacon of the early church is “looser” than he acknowledges.’ Richard Lennan, Review of Thomas B. Dozeman, *Holiness and Ministry: A Biblical Theology of Ordination*. *Theological Studies*, 71 (2010): 100.
- 40 Calvin, *Institutes*, IV.19.28.
- 41 The Panel on Doctrine offered significant reflections on ordination to the General Assembly in 1989, 2000 and 2001. I am grateful to David Stewart who provided me with a list of the occasions the Panel reported on ordination.
- 42 Wotherspoon and Kirkpatrick, *A Manual of Church Doctrine*, 91.
- 43 *Reports to the General Assembly 2001*, 13/19.
- 44 *Reports to the General Assembly 2000*, 13/18.

- <sup>45</sup> Cf. *Reports to the General Assembly 2001*, 13/4.
- <sup>46</sup> See Stephen V. Sprinkle, *Ordination: Celebrating the Gift of Ministry* (St Louis, Mo.: Chalice Press, 2004), 21.
- <sup>47</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2000*, 13/16.
- <sup>48</sup> *Reports to the General Assembly 2001*, 13/20.
- <sup>49</sup> Thomas F. Torrance, "Consecration and Ordination", *Scottish Journal of Theology* 11 (1958): 225–52 (244).
- <sup>50</sup> Thomas F. Torrance, *Theology in Reconciliation: Essays Towards Evangelical and Catholic Unity in East and West* (London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1975), 83. A phrase used in relation to baptism and communion, but which I think can also be applied to ordination.
- <sup>51</sup> Torrance, *Consecration and Ordination*, 233.
- <sup>52</sup> George Hunsinger, "The Dimension of Depth: Thomas F. Torrance on the Sacraments of Baptism and the Lord's Supper", *Scottish Journal of Theology* 54 (2001): 155–76 (161).
- <sup>53</sup> Torrance, *Theology in Reconciliation*, 88, 89.
- <sup>54</sup> *Ibid.*, 134.
- <sup>55</sup> Torrance, *Consecration and Ordination*, 241.
- <sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*, 242.
- <sup>57</sup> Guder, "The Church as Missional Community", 116.
- <sup>58</sup> 1 Corinthians 12.
- <sup>59</sup> The leadership role of the Parish minister is one that particularly interests me. Space does not permit me to explore it in this paper, but there may be an opportunity to do so in a later one.